



## **SUMMARIZED SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES**

### **HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

**Community Design Studio  
7506 E. Indian School Road  
Scottsdale, Arizona  
February 8, 2006**

#### **ATTENDANCE**

**Present:** Ed Wimmer, Chairman  
George Hartz, Vice-Chairman  
Nancy Dallett  
Dezbah Hatathli  
Kathy Howard

**Absent:** Lisa Loss  
Paul Winslow

**Staff:** Bob Cafarella  
Don Meserve

#### **1. CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL**

Chairman Wimmer called the meeting to order at 4:54 p.m. The presence of Commissioners as shown above was noted.

#### **2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

##### **MINUTES: JANUARY 12, 2006 AND JANUARY 28, 2006 SPECIAL MEETING**

**COMMISSIONER HOWARD MOVED FOR APPROVAL OF THE JANUARY 12, 2006 MEETING MINUTES AS AMENDED. COMMISSIONER HATATHLI SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY BY A VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).**

**COMMISSIONER DALLETT MOVED FOR APPROVAL OF THE JANUARY 28, 2006 SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES. COMMISSIONER HOWARD SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY BY A VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).**

**NOTE** IN ACCORDANCE WITH PROVISIONS OF THE ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES, THE SUMMARIZED MINUTES OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETINGS ARE NOT VERBATIM TRANSCRIPTS, ONLY THE ACTIONS TAKEN AND DISCUSSION APPEARING WITH QUOTATION MARKS ARE VERBATIM.

### **3. DRAFT 2006 WORK PROGRAM**

Chairman Wimmer requested that the Commission review the distributed Draft version of the 2006 Work Program. He noticed that a blank space appeared after the language "initiate on the designation." Mr. Meserve indicated that at the retreat no specific number was discussed, therefore it was left blank for later insertion. Chairman Wimmer suggested that the blank space should be stricken completely and no numeration be added. Commissioner Dallett suggested the language "in addition" be added instead.

Chairman Wimmer opened the floor for other comments and/or observations from the Commission.

As a result of a question by Commissioner Dallett, Chairman Wimmer suggested adding 'with urgency' to the statement concerning the downtown project.

Vice-Chairman Hartz suggested that "two downtown walking tours", which is under the subheading of Community Education Outreach, be changed to exclude the numeration, thus reading "downtown walking tours."

Discussion ensued regarding the HP Assistance for OLPH Mission Church. Mr. Meserve noted that staff added this proposed activity for their consideration as a way to implement the publicity ideas discussed at the Retreat.

Vice-Chairman Hartz suggested that the Commission include under the subtitle Survey contacting the owner of the Motorola Building on McDowell Road in Scottsdale to discuss historic preservation. Discussion ensued.

Chairman Wimmer stated that he would like the language "with urgency" added to the first bullet at the end of the 5th Avenue Designation.

Mr. Meserve reported that he was contacted by Lois Fitch regarding the downtown area. He stated that she wanted to know why the Commission was mainly concerned with the 5th Avenue area of downtown. Mr. Meserve stated that he informed Ms. Fitch that the Commission felt a sense of urgency where 5th Avenue was concerned.

Commissioner Dallett stated that she was under the impression that the Commission was interested in focusing on more areas of the downtown. Mr. Cafarella cautioned the Commission about including too many projects for the 2006 Work Program.

Chairman Wimmer reminded the Commission that the 5th Avenue project would be a prototype for other potential districts in the downtown. He further suggested adding Main Street to the Commission Watch list.

**COMMISSIONER DALLETT MOVED FOR APPROVAL OF THE 2006 WORK PROGRAM AS AMMENDED. COMMISSIONER HATATHLI SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY BY A VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).**

#### **4. DIRECTION TO STAFF ON NEXT STEPS FOR 1950s NEIGHBORHOOD HISTORIC DISTRICTS**

Mr. Meserve directed the Commission to review distributed materials, which included the Historic Register Committee report on 1950's HP designation for Cavalier Vista 3 and 4, Scottsdale Estates 4, and Sherwood Heights.

Chairman Wimmer stated that it is his opinion that the Planning Commission is not interested in HP designation for the aforementioned neighborhoods. He further indicated that the HP Commission should work constructively to "find ways to blunt" the concerns of the Planning Commission. He indicated that presentations made to the Planning Commission should be deliberate and positive. He opined that the HP Commission should be wary of being drawn into a "popularity contest" by the Planning Commission.

Chairman Wimmer stated that documentation and arguments should be found to support the Commission's recommendations. He further stated that if the City Council is interested in historic preservation and additional neighborhood historic districts, it is the responsibility of the HP Commission to work towards that goal.

Chairman Wimmer stated that obtaining approval for HP designation of the three aforementioned neighborhoods was going to be a difficult task for various reasons. He reiterated that having solid rationale and documentation for future presentations to City Council is of great importance.

Commissioner Dallett opined that the Commission did a very good job in trying to get a wide variety of representative 1950s neighborhoods. She stated that the Commission previously argued why the aforementioned neighborhoods had been chosen. She opined that the Planning Commission expressed concerns at the Joint Meeting regarding negating the rights of the property owners by designating neighborhoods as historic districts.

Discussion ensued regarding Sherwood Heights and the still pending lawsuit.

Discussion ensued regarding initiating the HP process for two of the three neighborhoods.

Commissioner Howard questioned whether the HP process should be modified to make it more acceptable to the Commission's colleagues. Chairman Wimmer suggested that the Commission could take the next 30 days to work on process refinement. He further suggested that the FAQ section should be expanded, as well as, inviting a member of the Planning Commission to an HP Study Session to assist in the process refinement. He suggested scheduling a joint Study Session with the Planning Commission approximately 30 days before future hearings on HP cases.

Mr. Cafarella expressed frustration with past Planning Commission Study Sessions. He stated that staff is always available to answer any questions of the Commission 30 days prior to their hearing. However, they are rarely asked questions by Commissioners in the Study Sessions or agenda review. He suggested that it might be more productive to

have a Commissioner, as the applicant, present future cases to the Planning Commission. However, staff does not want to impinge on the time of the Commission.

Vice-Chairman Hartz opined that a study session would not be needed in single owner designations, as long as there is support from the Commission. He further opined that study sessions with the Planning Commission are probably needed for multi-owner situations, such as neighborhood historic district designations. He suggested that Commissioners should be present at study sessions.

Discussion ensued regarding the study session process.

Mr. Cafarella indicated that staff will work more diligently to inform the public about the process being used for proposed HP designations. Commissioner Wimmer added that expanding the FAQ section of the mailings would be beneficial in informing the public.

**COMMISSIONER DALLETT MOVED THAT THE COMMISSION DIRECT STAFF TO TAKE THE NEXT STEPS FOR THE TWO 1950'S NEIGHBORHOOD HISTORIC DISTRICTS, CAVALIER VISTA III AND IV AND SCOTTSDALE ESTATES IV, AND TO BEGIN THE PUBLIC MEETING PROCESS, AS WELL AS INVOLVING PREVIOUSLY DESIGNATED COMMUNITIES IN PUBLIC MEETINGS, TOWN AND COUNTRY AND VILLAGE GROVE RESIDENTS, TO BE DONE AS SOON AS POSSIBLE WITHIN STAFF'S CAPABILITY. FURTHER MOTION IS MADE BY COMMISSIONER DALLETT TO REVIEW THE 17 STEP HP PROCESS AND UPDATE THE FAQ. COMMISSIONER HOWARD SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY BY A VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).**

**5. REVIEW UPDATED INFORMATION ON 5<sup>TH</sup> AVENUE PROPERTIES AND CONSIDER DIRECTION TO STAFF ON NEXT STEPS FOR 5<sup>TH</sup> AVENUE HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Mr. Meserve directed the Commission to review to materials distributed consisting of a color aerial and numbered legend for projects. He offered a report regarding the color aerial of 5th Avenue. He further indicated that new aerials were taken in November 2005 and would be available for the Commission to review in Spring 2006. Mr. Meserve reported that the Commission could review information on the current and proposed projects in the 5th Avenue area on the City's website under "Projects in the News".

Mr. Cafarella offered further report, indicating that the Commission may be able to join with other groups and City departments. He stated that staff would have more information for the Commission at the next regular scheduled meeting.

Chairman Wimmer opined that there would probably be little support from the primary property owner for designation if no incentives were offered. He stated that it would be premature to begin initiation of a historic district on 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue at this time.

In response to a question posed by Chairman Wimmer, Mr. Meserve stated that Ian Johnson, an intern has been doing research on 5th Avenue.

In response to a question posed by Vice-Chairman Hartz regarding the boundaries of the project, Mr. Meserve indicated that staff has maps and a list of addresses based upon earlier boundary discussions, but did not copy these materials for this meeting.

Discussion ensued regarding boundaries for a potential historic district on 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue.

In response to a request by Commissioner Dallett, Mr. Cafarella read an email he sent to other City departments/divisions into the record as follows:

"The HP Commission conducted it's annual retreat Saturday at the Valley Ho where there was a flurry of activity and we learned the hotel was booked through the season. During the discussion of the '06 Work Program, 5th Avenue was clearly one of the highest priorities of the Commission. The discussion was interesting. Some on the Commission believed due to rising property values in the downtown, coupled with the limitations of leasable space in many buildings, larger and more intense buildings will be necessary to remain economically viable. The potential consequences would be the loss of the unique character of Scottsdale's downtown, the very thing that makes it so special in the Valley.

This is a major concern of the Commission, and not just because of the consequences of historic buildings. Relating this discussion to 5th Avenue, Commissioners all agreed that to preserve the key features of the important buildings and to maintain the overall character of the district, change and intensification along with strategic incentives to get things started and developers/landowners interested will be necessary.

Commissioners see this effort as a partnership between economic development and historic preservation. To begin their consideration of the issues the Commission asked staff to prepare information on potential incentives that could be used to make things happen. Commissioners also indicated they wanted to touch base with Council members once they have a handle on potential incentives to gauge where Council members are and to encourage them to support the Commission's effort."

Mr. Cafarella indicated that response from other City staff to his email was excellent.

**VICE-CHAIRMAN HARTZ MOVED THE COMMISSION TO INSTRUCT STAFF TO CONTINUE THEIR VARIOUS PRE-INITIATION ACTIVITIES ASSOCIATED WITH THE POTENTIAL 5TH AVENUE HISTORIC DISTRICT, WORKING WITH OTHER DEPARTMENTS WITHIN THE CITY AS APPROPRIATE AND PROVIDING THE COMMISSION WITH OPTIONS AND A STATUS REPORT BY THE NEXT SCHEDULED COMMISSION MEETING. COMMISSIONER HOWARD SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY BY A VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).**

**6. APPROVAL OF THE CONTENT OF THE PRESERVATION GUIDELINES FOR VILLAGE GROVE AND TOWN AND COUNTRY**

Mr. Meserve offered the report and distributed copies of the revised Village Grove guidelines. He indicated that the previously distributed materials for Town and Country were current.

Discussion ensued regarding the content of the preservation guidelines.

**COMMISSIONER HOWARD MOVED FOR APPROVAL OF THE CONTENT OF THE REVISED PRESERVATION GUIDELINES FOR VILLAGE GROVE AND TOWN AND COUNTRY. COMMISSIONER HATATHLI SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY BY A VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).**

## **7. COMMITTEE REPORTS/UPDATES/MEETING SCHEDULES**

- **Taliesin West HP Zoning Activity Report**

Commissioner Dallett indicated that she had a meeting with Ms. Abele on January 19, 2006 but that no other members of the Committee attended, therefore no Committee report was given.

Chairman Wimmer stated that a hearing on Taliesin West HP Overlay Zoning will be held before the Planning Commission on February 22, 2006 at 5:00 p.m. in City Hall. Commissioner Dallett will make the presentation on behalf of the Commission. He further indicated that he will be in attendance, as well.

Discussion ensued regarding attendance of Commissioners, as well as representatives from Taliesin West and the Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation, owner at the Planning Commission hearing on February 22, 2006.

Commissioner Dallett suggested obtaining a letter from the new Chairman of the Board for the Foundation. She indicated that she spoke with Ms. Abele, as well as Beverly Hart regarding this issue. Ms. Hart indicated that a new letter would not be necessary. Discussion ensued.

- **Community Outreach**

Vice-Chairman Hartz offered the report.

Discussion ensued regarding participation of Commissioners on our entry wagon for the Parada Del Sol.

Discussion ensued regarding decorating the entry wagon for the parade.

Chairman Wimmer suggested inviting members of the Historic Register Committee, as well as former Commission members to participate.

Vice-Chairman Hartz invited members of the Community Outreach Committee.

Vice-Chairman Hartz reported that Design Day will be held on Saturday February 25th from 8:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m. He invited Commissioners to join him at a historic preservation table so they could answer questions from participants.

Vice-Chairman Hartz stated that he would be contacting Roberta Pilcher, who is in charge of the Winfield Scott Birthday Celebration, to request permission to

establish a presentation site that would include brochures and sign-up information to receive information on the historic preservation program.

- **Historic Register**

Commissioner Howard indicated that the Historic Register Committee has not been convening on a regular basis. With the upcoming neighborhood designation process, she feels that the Committee should begin meeting on a more regular basis. She requested suggestions from the Commission regarding solicitation of participation. Discussion ensued.

Vice-Chairman indicated that the Commission was informed at the retreat that there was considerable interest on the part of the Mayor in western-themed steak houses in the Reata Pass area as part of cowboy tourism. Mr. Meserve noted that the topic was listed under Survey activities in the approved 2006 Work Program.

## **8. HPO/STAFF REPORT**

- **2/11 Neighborhood Historic District Sign Installation**

Mr. Meserve reported that the notices were sent to residents, the Mayor and Council, and the media to inform them of dates and times. The Village Grove installation will occur at 1:30 p.m. on Saturday, February 11, 2006 on the corner of Oak Street & 66th Place. The Town and Country installation will occur at 2:15 p.m. on the corner of Cypress and 73rd Place.

Discussion ensued regarding attendance of Commissioners and Council Members.

Mr. Cafarella indicated that Chairman Wimmer may want to be prepared to speak at the event, although there has been no indication or schedule set forth at this time for him to do so.

Mr. Meserve indicated that no further mailings to inform the public will be done at this time. Mr. Cafarella indicated that staff could have further discussions regarding emails or doorhangers to be distributed prior to February 11, 2006.

- **2/18 Parada del Sol Information**

Mr. Meserve offered the report. The entry number this year is number 27. The meeting location for Commissioners who will be participating is the Goodwill parking lot.

Mr. Meserve offered a report on rehab funding, noting that February 15, 2006 is the deadline for the neighborhood applications. He stated that a Selection Committee meeting would be scheduled at a future time. Vice-Chairman Hartz has previously volunteered to serve on the Selection Committee.

## **9. COMMISSION/STAFF/PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Chairman Wimmer stated that Commissioner Loss has resigned from the Commission due to time conflicts. Mr. Meserve will contact the City Council once he has received Commissioner Loss' formal written resignation.

Mr. Meserve indicated that the process for the selection of a new Commissioner is fairly involved and may take up to two months. He suggested that if any of the Commissioners know of someone with a real estate background they could encourage those persons to apply. An official notice will be issued indicating that the City of Scottsdale is seeking someone to fill Commissioner Loss' position. Discussion ensued regarding possible candidates to fill the new vacancy.

Chairman Wimmer suggested that the Commission should have a member of the Planning Commission sit with the Commission as ex officio. He further indicated that the Commission should expect to see this topic on a future agenda as an action item. Commissioner Dallett requested the assistance of Mr. Cafarella for a presentation on Taliesin West HP. Chairman Wimmer strongly suggested that Commissioner Dallett open the presentation with a detailed follow-up by staff. Discussion ensued.

Mr. Meserve indicated that Ms. Abele was contacted by FEMA to assist with the Hurricane Katrina Relief in the Gulf Coast Region. She will not be available to attend Commission meetings for approximately a 90 day period.

No members of the public wished to address the Board.

## **10. FUTURE MEETING SCHEDULE AND AGENDA ITEMS**

The March 9, 2006 meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission on has been canceled. The next scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission will be held on March 2, 2006 at 5:00 p.m. in the Design Studio.

## **11. ADJOURNMENT**

There being no other business to discuss, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 6:41 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,  
A/V Tronics, Inc.